Supreme Court, U.S.
FILED
051331 APR 14 2006
OFFICE OF THE CLERK

No. ____

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

October Term, 2005

ROBERT L. SCHULZ

Petitioner,

DIANE LUKARIS, KEITH GILLIGAN, JUDITH PORCARO

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

- against -

WASHINGTON COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, ANDREW J. WILLIAMSON, individually and in his official capacity as Chairman of the Washington County Board of Supervisors, WASHINGTON COUNTY TREASURER'S OFFICE, PHYLLIS COOPER, individually and in her official capacity as Washington County Treasurer, WASHINGTON COUNTY CLERK'S OFFICE, DEBORAH BEAHAN, individually and in her official capacity as Washington County Clerk,

(Caption continued on inside cover)

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

ROBERT L. SCHULZ
Pro Se
2458 Ridge Road
Queensbury, NY 12804
(518) 656-3578

No. _____

WARREN COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, WILLIAM H. THOMAS, individually and in his official capacity as Chairman of the Warren County Board of Supervisors, WARREN COUNTY TREASURER'S OFFICE, FRANCIS X. O'KEEFE, individually and in his official capacity as Warren County Treasurer, WARREN COUNTY CLERK'S OFFICE, PAMELA VOGEL, individually and in her official capacity as Warren County Clerk,

Respondents.

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

Whether, under the Petition Clause of the First Amendment to the United States Constitution, government Respondents are obligated to respond with specific, formal answers to Petitioners' Petition for Redress of Grievance and whether Petitioners can retain their money until their grievances are redressed.

Whether the federal Tax Injunction Act can trump the Petition Clause of the First Amendment to the United States Constitution and deprive the federal courts of jurisdiction.

PARTIES

The names of all parties to the proceeding in the court whose judgment is sought to be reviewed here appear in the caption of the case.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Questions Presented.....	i
Parties	ii
Table of Contents	iii
Table of Authorities	vi
Opinions Below	1
Jurisdiction	1
Constitutional and Statutory Provisions Involved.	2
Statement of the Case	
A. Overview	2
B. Statement of Facts.....	6
C. Federal Jurisdiction In District Court.....	11
Reasons for granting the Writ:	
I. This is a First Amendment Case of First Impression.....	11
II. The Petitions For Redress Are Proper.....	11
III. Government Is Obligated To Respond To Proper Petitions For Redress Of Grievances	
a. Overview of the History, Meaning, Effect and Significance of the Right to Petition.....	12
b. This Interest In Government Accountability Was Understood To Demand Government Response To Petitions.....	17
c. Retaliation is Prohibited.....	20
d. Production of Information and Answers to Questions is the Only Legitimate Response.....	22

TABLE OF CONTENTS (cont'd)

	Page
IV. The Right To Petition Includes The Right Of Redress Before Taxes.....	22
V. The Tax Injunction Act Cannot Trump The Constitution.....	24
VI. A Remedy Is Unavailable In State Court.....	26

APPENDIX

A. Order: U.S. Court of Appeals, for the Second Circuit, filed January 19, 2006.....	A-1
B. Order: U.S. Court of Appeals, for the Second Circuit, filed August 15, 2005.....	A-3
C. Order: U.S. District Court, Northern Dist. of NY, filed December 16, 2004	A-7
D. Order: U.S. District Court, Northern Dist. Of NY, filed December 14, 2004	A-11
E. Petition for Redress of Grievances, 2/16/03	
1. Letter, Schulz to Asplund, 2/16/03.....	A-20
2. "Evidence Of Fraudulent Behavior That Put The Taxpayers Of Washington (And Warren) County On The Hook For Hundreds Of Millions Of Dollars Bond Payments And Operating Costs Related To The Hudson Falls Trash Plant," dated 2/16/03.....	A-22
3. Chapter 682 NY laws of 1985.....	A-26
4. Letter, Little to Nikas, 4/22/85.....	A-27
5. Letter, Rota to Crotty, 6/28/85.....	A-29
6. Selected paragraphs of ANSWER, *Schulz v. NY State Legislature*, (Schulz I), 7/13/98.....	A-30
7.Selected paragraphs of Affidavit, *Schulz v. State of New York*, (Schulz II), 8/25/92.....	A-32
F. Petition for Redress to Washington County Board Including List of Ten Law Review Articles on the Right to Petition.....	A-36

TABLE OF CONTENTS (Cont'd)

	Page
G. Verified Complaint (this case), Nov. 16, 2004.....	A-41
H. Excerpts from Transcript, (this case), 12/8/04.....	A-71
I. Notice of Auction Date For one of Plaintiffs' Properties.....	A-73

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

FEDERAL CASES

Adderley v. Florida, 385 U.S. 39, 40-42 (1966)..... 14
California v. Grace Brethren Church, 457 U.S. 393..... 28
Chicago, Indianapolis & Louisville Railway
Company v. Hackett,228 U.S. 559..... 26
De Jonge v. Oregon, 299 U.S. 353, 364 (1937)..... 22
Edwards v. South Carolina, 372 U.S. 229, 238..... 14
Ex parte Siebold, 100 U.S. 371..... 26
Hebert v. Louisiana, 272 U.S. 312, 316..... 22
HIBBS v Winn, 124 S. Ct. 2276.....27,29
Kraebel v NYC Dept. of Housing Preservation and
Development, 959 F.2d 395..... 28
Linkletter v. Walker, 381 U.S. 618..... 26
Marbury v. Madison. 5 U.S. (1 Cranch) 139 (1803)..... 15,26
Massachusetts v. Mellon, 262 U.S. 447..... 27
McDonald v. Smith, 472 U.S. 479, 483 (1985)..... 20
Mine Workers v. Illinois Bar Assn.,
389 U.S., at 221-222..... 14
N. A. A. C. P. v. Button, 371 U.S. 415, 433 (1963)..... 14,25
NAACP v. Claiborne Hardware Co.,
458 U.S. 886 (1982) 14
New York Times Co. v. U.S., 403 U.S. 670,
716 n.2 (1971)..... 17
Norton v. Shelby County, 118 U.S. 425 (1886)..... 26
Powell v. Alabama, 287 U.S. 45, 67..... 22
Reynoldsville Casket Co. v. Hyde, 514 U.S. 749..... 27
Roswell v. La Salle Nat'l Bank, 67 L. Ed. 2d 464..... 5,28,29
The Employers' Liability Cases, 207 U.S. 463..... 26
United States v. Cruikshank, 92 U.S. 542, 552 (1876)... 22

STATE CASES

Schulz v State of New York, 603 N.Y.S.2d 207
(3rd Dep't 1993)."(*Schulz I*)..... passim
Schulz v. New York State Legislature, 773 N.Y.S.2d 174
(3rd Dep't 2004) (Schulz II)..... passim

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (Cont'd)

Page

FEDERAL STATUTES

28 U.S.C. 1257..... 1
28 U.S.C. 1331..... 12
28 U.S.C section 1341(Tax Injunction Act)..... passim
28 U.S.C. 1343..... 12
42 U.S.C. 1983..... 5,12

STATE STATUTES

Chapter 682 of the New York Laws of 1985..... passim
New York State Real Property Tax Law, ... passim
New York State General Municipal Law, Section 870.... 8,10
New York State General Municipal Law, Section 120w.. 9

UNITED STATES CONSTITUTION

Article VI 27
First Amendment, ... passim
Fifth Amendment..... 2
Ninth Amendment..... 25
Fourteenth Amendment..... 2

NEW YORK STATE CONSTITUTION

Article I, Section 14..... 8
Article IX, Section 2(b)(2)..... passim
Article IX, Section 3(d)(4)..... 8

OTHER REFERENCES

Higginson, Stephen A., "A SHORT HISTORY OF THE RIGHT TO PETITION GOVERNMENT FOR THE REDRESS OF GRIEVANCES," 96 Yale L.J. 142 (November, 1986)..... 15,20,23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (Cont'd)

Page

Smith, Norman B., "SHALL MAKE NO LAW ABRIDGING . . .": AN ANALYSIS OF THE NEGLECTED, BUT NEARLY ABSOLUTE, RIGHT OF PETITION," 54 U. Cin. L. Rev. 1153 (1986)..... 15,16

Schnapper, Eric, "LIBELOUS" PETITIONS FOR REDRESS OF GRIEVANCES -- BAD ISTORIOGRAPHY MAKES WORSE LAW," 74 Iowa L. Rev. 303 (January 1989)..... 15

Amar, Akhil Reed, "THE BILL OF RIGHTS AS A CONSTITUTION," 100 Yale L.J. 1131 (March, 1991).. 15

NOTE: A PETITION CLAUSE ANALYSIS OF SUITS AGAINST THE GOVERNMENT: IMPLICATIONS FOR RULE 11 SANCTIONS, "106 Harv. L. Rev. 1111 (MARCH, 1993)..... 15

Pfander, James E., "SOVEREIGN IMMUNITY AND THE RIGHT TO PETITION: TOWARD A FIRST AMENDMENT RIGHT TO PURSUE JUDICIAL CLAIMS AGAINST THE GOVERNMENT, " 91 Nw. U.L. Rev. 899 (Spring 1997)..... 15

Mark, Gregory A., "THE **VESTIGIAL CONSTITUTION:** THE HISTORY AND SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RIGHT TO PETITION," 66 Fordham L. Rev. 2153 (May, 1998)..... 15

Lawson, Gary and Seidman, Guy, "DOWNSIZING THE RIGHT TO PETITION," *93 Nw. U.L. Rev. 739* (Spring 1999)..... 15

Rice-Andrews, Carol, "A RIGHT OF ACCESS TO COURT UNDER THE PETITION CLAUSE OF THE FIRST AMENDMENT: DEFINING THE RIGHT," 60 Ohio St. L.J. 557 (1999) 15

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (cont'd)

	Page
Rice-Andrews, Carol, "MOTIVE RESTRICTIONS ON COURT ACCESS: A FIRST AMENDMENT CHALLENGE," Carol Rice Andrews, 61 Ohio St. L.J. 665 (2000).....	15
Bill of Rights, 1689, 1 W & M., ch. 2 Sections 5,13 (Eng.), reprinted in 5 THE FOUNDERS' CONSITUTION 197 (Philip B. Kurland & Ralph Lerner eds. 1987).....	16
Frederick, David C., "JOHN QUINCY ADAMS, SLAVERY, AND THE DISAPPEARANCE OF THE RIGHT TO PETITION," 9 LAW & HIST. REV. 113, at 115.....	16
Rice, Charles E., "FREEDOM OF PETITION", in 2 ENCYCLOPEDIA OF THE AMERICAN CONSTITUTION 789, (Leonard W. Levy ed., 1986)....	16
Anderson, David A., "THE ORIGINS OF THE PRESS CLAUSE," 30 UCLA L. REV. 455, 463 n.47 (1983).....	16
1 ANNALS OF CONG. (Joseph Gales ed., 1834).....	17,19
5 BERNARD SCHWARTZ, THE ROOTS OF THE BILL OF RIGHTS (1980).....	17,19
Smith, Don L. "THE RIGHT TO PETITION FOR REDRESS OF GRIEVANCES: CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND INTERPRETATIONS" (1971) (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation) (Univ. Microforms Int'l).....	17
Smellie, K., " RIGHT TO PETITION," in 12 ENCYCLOPEDIA OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES, (R.A. Seiligman ed., 1934).....	17

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (cont'd)

	Page
MAGNA CARTA (1215), 5 THE FOUNDERS' CONSTITUTION.....	17,19
"PETITION OF RIGHT" (1628), 5 THE FOUNDERS' CONSTITUTION.....	17
Bailey, Raymond, "POPULAR INFLUENCE UPON PUBLIC POLICY: PETITIONING IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY VIRGINIA" (1979)	18
Cooley, Thomas M., " TREATISE ON THE CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITATIONS WHICH REST UPON THE LEGISLATIVE POWER OF THE STATES OF THE AMERICAN UNION" (6th ed. 1890).....	18
CONG. GLOBE, 39th Cong., 1st Session. 1293 (1866) ...	18
Story, Joseph, "COMMENTARIES ON THE CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES" (Carolina Academic Press ed. 1987) (1833)	18
"DECLARATION AND RESOLVES OF THE CONTINENTAL CONGRESS 3" (Am. Col. Oct. 14, 1774), reprinted in 5 THE FOUNDERS' CONSTITUTION.....	19
DECLARATION OF RIGHTS OF THE STAMP ACT CONGRESS 13 (Am. Col. Oct. 19, 1765), reprinted in 5 THE FOUNDERS' CONSTITUTION	19
THE DECLARATION OF INDEPENDENCE (U.S. July 4, 1776), reprinted in 5 THE FOUNDERS' CONSTITUTION, *supra* n5 at 199.....	19
Strimbeck, Lee A., " THE RIGHT TO PETITION," 55 W. VA. L. REV. 275, 277 (1954).....	19